Anna Mahanor

Dr. Daniel A. Panici

CMS 200

May 5, 2020

<div align="center">Echo Chambers, Social Media, and Partisan Behavior</div>

This annotated bibliography will consist of articles that focus on echo chambers,

information cascades, and how social media influences political behaviors or interactions within

the immediate community. Seeing that our society normalizes the use of social media platforms

to gather information, it seems important to understand how social media plays a role in

persuading the community to think politically. Social media allows echo chambers to emerge

within the online community, and it can encourage the spread of misinformation through the

phenomenon known as information cascades. Individuals that identify with a certain party tend

to surround themselves with like minded partisans; therefore, there is a loss in the diversity of

political thinking. With this in mind, it is only natural to question how a community's political

interactions change once social media is taken away. Interestingly enough there is a study

conducted during the Egyptian uprising, when social media networks are shut down, that expand

on the notion of information cascades; the study insists that face-to-face interactions persuade

more conservative individuals. Information cascades are not inherently negative, nor do they

solely spread misinformation; basically, this phenomenon can be compared to herd thinking.

Individuals' political thought process is malleable, it is essentially based on societal norms; so if

individuals choose to label themselves to one category politically, there is a loss of diversity in

thought. Perhaps social media discourages society from associating with different individuals in

our immediate community based on political values, or vice versa. In order to understand the influence that social media has on political behaviors and interactions, the articles below are reviewed.

1) Chadwick, A., Vaccari, C., & O, L. B. (2018). Do tabloids poison the well of social media? Explaining democratically dysfunctional news sharing. *New Media & Society*, *20*(11), 4255–4274. https://doi.org/10.1177/1461444818769689

This study uses content analysis to analyze shared information on Twitter because it is the second most used media platform in England, with 25% of the population using it. The researchers tracked the most popular sources that produce tabloid articles and the user who shared them during the 2017 Brexit campaign and other influential political events. Following a quantitative approach the researchers then try to disentangle the results by asking different survey participants what their motives are for sharing tabloid news articles. A Likert scale is also used in order to analyze different areas of interest pertaining to echo chambers and tabloid news sharing. Of which, one of the questions asks if any person had disagreed with a tabloid that the participant had shared in the past month. Overall the methodologies used in this study give merit to the study and proves to be relevant when concerning social media and political behaviors.

Social media has become one of the most accessible outlets to gather information; however, this accessibility does not coincide with validity. Our society is exposed to a continuous flow of shared news on media, which ultimately perpetuates the spread of misinformation. With this in mind the study named: *Do tabloids poison the well of social media? Explaining democratically dysfunctional news sharing,* proves to be relevant when exploring the topic

influence that social media has on political behaviors and interactions. This study investigates the relationship between sharing tabloid news articles on social media and disinformation behaviors. The researchers discover that there is in fact a relationship between the two variables and can be a significant predictor of democratically dysfunctional misinformation. It is also concluded that when users engage with politically like minded individuals online, they will be less likely to come in contact with another source of information that opposes their political views. Therefore, if a source of misinformation starts to be shared within one of these subgroups, the less likely it will be challenged; a cycle of dysfunctional news sharing spreads. However, the researcher does imply that the news has to come from somewhere and that the major news networks are likely to be the biased reporters. So at a basic level, tabloid news logic has become intertwined with social media; this affects the sharing tendencies of social media users and shapes political behaviors.

2) Knüpfer, C. B. (2018). DIVERGING PROJECTIONS OF REALITY: Amplified frame competition via distinct modes of journalistic production. *Journalism Studies*, *19*(4), 594–611. https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2017.1387072

While this is not a study conducted through participant research; it still proves to be relevant when concerning the models of testing different hypotheses between communities and echo chambers. The methodology in use, in this sort of proposal, is through the analysis of text and other studies. This article is ultimately meant to act as a framework for scholars trying to approach and analyze instances of amplified frame competition in fragmented news environments. The researcher proposes guidelines that can be amended depending on the situation; overall, this piece aids in furthering knowledge about the aforementioned topic in this

annotated bibliography.

Diverging Projections of Reality introduces a different technique in which journalistic production can be observed through multiple media outlets; this study proves to be relevant when concerning the relationship between the community and echo chambers because it addresses a crucial issue. There is an absence of a system to observe the relationship between community and echo chambers. Echo chambers have become an accepted phenomena; in fact, their existence coincides with the notion that there is not a collective reality. A monolithic news environment essentially dictates a majority of information sources, despite the appearance of an abundance of information. The reports are biased in a way that allows political actors to persuade the public; these reports are then shared through individual echo chambers, which spreads a particular reality of a situation. This ideology can be applied to the Brexit or Trump campaigns, and explains why there can be such a rift between partisans.

3) Cardenal, A. S., Aguilar-Paredes, C., Cristancho, C., & Majó-Vázquez, S. (2019). Echo-chambers in online news consumption: Evidence from survey and navigation data in Spain. *European Journal of Communication*, *34*(4), 360–376. https://doi.org/10.1177/0267323119844409

In order to conduct this study, there are two interdependent datasets that are investigated. The method in procuring the necessary information is a two-wave survey that investigates the participants demographic traits and political ideology through a likert scale; participants' online navigation data, through coding, is applied to individual survey results. So with this in mind, it should be noted that the results of the findings do not accurately depict the entirety of the

population in spain. However, the online populace can be compared to the results and they are, in fact, the target group for the study. During the survey period, the researchers made sure to take into account major political events that could influence search results. The researchers document the time spent on each site and track the frequency of searches. There are several limitations to this study, of which is that mobile searches cannot be analyzed during this study period. Overall the study, while there are areas which could be refined, proves to be relevant when community interaction and media usage.

This study explores the circulation of fake news, or misinformation, and their relationship with echo chambers. The researchers that conduct this study prove its relevance by providing insight into the dysfunctionality that echo chambers encourage in society today. When concerning the topic of social media and political behaviors this article offers an explanation to political interactions that were involved in controversial moments like the Trump or Brexit campaign. The study expands upon the notion echo chambers encourage audience fragmentation, and group polarization, which ultimately poses a threat to a healthy democratic public life. In order to explore the impact that echo chambers have on political information consumption, online data from Spain via web-tracking and surveys are used. The conclusion is that media users devote more time to outlets of their political preferences, however the population is still exposed to cross partisan media. This finding is especially true for those that are considered to be politically left.

4) Hassanpour, N. (2014). Media Disruption and Revolutionary Unrest: Evidence From Mubarak's Quasi-Experiment. *Political Communication*, *31*(1), 1–24. https://doi.org/10.1080/10584609.2012.737439

The researcher begins this study with suggestive archival evidence and then uses records from the 2011 political unrest to analyze the relationship between media use and political behavior. This situation is unique, however, because the results are postulated from a period in time during which the government caused a media blackout. The researcher determines the impact of the media disruption by studying the dispersion of the uprisings; the disruption is coded over the five day period of media black out. The researcher also takes into account physical limitations that could have impacted the uprisings, like police barricades and blocked roads. Despite these limitations, it is seen that the protests were not at their highest when the social media network was available for use. So, this alludes to the nature in which echo chambers exist. Altogether, the researchers' findings prove that there is infact a correlation between social media and its effect on the community, as well as the influence of face to face communications' impact on information cascades.

Hassanpour Navid produces an exceptional study that analyzes the relationship between societal uprisings in Egypt and the disruption of the media network during 2011. Within the study the phenomena known as information cascades is explored. Navid suggests that information cascades assist in persuading conservative individuals to leave their preconceived notions, formed from the echo chambers they became a part of online. When the media shut down, people were forced to leave their regular social media groups; instead their new interactions were face to face communications within the immediate community surrounding

them. The focus of this study proves to be relevant when concerning the influence that social media has on political behaviors and interactions. The exploration of Information cascades suggests that individuals will inevitably go against their own personal knowledge of a situation, if they are aware of other individuals doing the same thing. So in the case of a societal uprising, individuals who were usually more complacent within their media circles were now engaging with the more diverse opinion in the public. They in turn would be influenced by the other individuals in order to figure out what was going on with the shutdown of the media and online social networks. Individuals would start to follow the flow of the information cascade and their behaviors are then shaped by it, leading to revolutionary unrest.

5) SHMARGAD, Y., & KLAR, S. (2019). How Partisan Online Environments Shape Communication with Political Outgroups. *International Journal of Communication (19328036)*, *13*, 2287–2313.

This study is made up of the independent variable, the online environment that participants are exposed to, and the dependent variable which is the political behavior or information that the individual shares. There are 139 individuals who participate anonymously, in the one shot case study, at a large university. The participants self assess and report their involvement in media and what their political affiliation is via an anonymous self assessment. Participants then read through a series of articles published on healthcare through different political media sources and are asked to then share different articles with the outgroups they are assigned to. The researchers then compute all of the results in order to see the impact that echo chambers has on political behavior. Overall the results from *How Partisan Online Environments*

Shape Communication with Political Outgroups proves to be relevant to the main topic of this annotated bibliography.

The conclusion from this experimental study shows that participants who interact with political outgroups on social media regularly, share more politically moderate news articles when placed in a group full of out-partisans. Conversely, individuals who are familiar with their social media echo chambers, will shift their political behavior when placed within an outgroup audience. Essentially this study suggests that an individual's media exposure online can influence political interactions. However, the researchers state that pretreatment measures should be used, to understand how online environments influence political behavior, in a more in depth manner. Despite the additional measure that could be taken, this study is a valuable source when contemplating the effects that social media has on political behavior within the community.

6) The New Boundary Spanners: Social Media Users, Engagement, and Public Relations Outcomes. (2011). *Conference Papers -- International Communication Association*, 1–45.

The New Boundary Spanners: Social Media Users, Engagement, and Public Relations Outcomes is a study which explores the relationships among social media users, social media engagement, and corporate public relations. The researchers in this study administered online surveys to 403 individuals. The data from these surveys is analyzed in order to determine how online engagement with corporations, on social media, correlates with positive consumer relationships. The participants were given both Likert scales and Semantic scales to measure their satisfaction with the corporations. The participants being chosen seem like they may produce skewed results because they may not accurately represent the population of individuals

that live in impoverished areas. In addition to this, the participants are already familiar with the organizations. All of the participants were graduate and undergraduate students from a large Northeastern university. This group was chosen because the researchers stated that the college students would have more experience with the organizations in the surveys. While this could be amended for future studies to be more inclusive of a different population, this study proves to be relevant when concerning social media use and political behavior; even though this study does not have to do with politics, this deduction is made after taking note of the additional factor of individuals data being accessible to political groups and corporations as seen in the Brexit and Trump campaigns.

This study provides evidence regarding public relations and social media use. The results showed that an organization's involvement with the public online, can positively impact public relations outcomes. In conclusion, Amazon and Starbucks' social media engagement has a strong positive effect on both relational satisfaction and relational commitment. With this in mind, an organization's involvement with a political candidate could also have more impact over the general public than the populace realizes. This also means that the embedment of corporate offices and their involvement within the community influences the public. Therefore the online interactions between political figures and the public could be seen in the same light. In conclusion this article proves to be beneficial when considering the implications of social media use and behavior, whether the interactions are political or not.

7) Bastos, M., Mercea, D., & Baronchelli, A. (2018). The Geographic Embedding of Online Echo Chambers: Evidence from the Brexit Campaign. *Conference Papers -- International Communication Association*, 1–29.

The Geographic Embedding of Online Echo Chambers: Evidence from the Brexit Campaign explores the ideological clustering in politically homogeneous echo chambers online and in relation to their geographic location. In order to conduct this research, the geographic locations of political messages put out on Twitter during the Brexit campaign in England are analyzed. While this study is solely based on tweets during the Brexit Campaign, there are procedures introduced that made this study explicit and precise. Initially the researchers sought to divide the tweets into three general categories Leave, Neutral, and Remain. However, they limited their timeline within the confines of the actual Brexit Campaign and eliminated any tweets that were made either before or after the actual campaigning period. In order to label each tweet properly, they decided that they were going to code for tweets that had hashtags suggesting a stance on leaving or remaining. Twenty different hashtags were analyzed on both sides, and in order to be neutral tags like in or out were considered. The amount of tags used also deemed an individual as neutral or not; therefore, if the tweet only used one hashtag they were considered to be neutral. Once the tweets were divided into the three different categories, the geographic locations came into play. Any tweet that could not be pinned down to an area code within the UK was eliminated from the analysis. The researchers then could map the clustering of tweets either supporting the transition out of the EU or the tweets advocating to stay. The researchers ran over 100 interactions of each test, and took into account super users (individuals online thought to have more sway or popularity). Each of these precautions taken in the content analysis deems the

study more precise and explicit.

The purpose behind exploring the relationship between these variables derives from the notion that the ideological clustering, which is seen in homogeneous echo chambers, ultimately jeopardizes political compromises; face-to-face interactions, however, allow for a diversity of political interactions and encourages cross-partisan behavior. Through the five different variations of hypotheses in this experiment, a clear correlation between social media and political behavior forms. Ultimately the geographic proximity and echo chamber communication is seen exclusively in the Leave campaign. This finding suggests that there has to be another party, such as advertisements, that influence the behavior of these social media users within their echo chambers. This finding pushes the original topic of this annotated bibliography to evolve because social media has more than just connections between users or news networks. Essentially, corporations' use of personal data and data rights should be considered when dissecting the convoluted topic of social media and echo chambers.